

KINGS LA W REPORTS
(ALL SC)
(1996) 9 KLR PART 44 pp. 1539-1813
SEPTEMBER 1996

Dedicated to the King of kings

O.O. NOEL ESQ. Chief Editor

INDEX OF CASES REPORTED

1. Olukoga v Fatunde p. 1539
2. Chukwu v. The State p. 1555
3. Oladokun v. Governor of Oyo State p. 1572
4. Badejo v Federal Ministry of Education p. 1609
5. Edhigere v. The State p. 1661
6. Insurance Brokers V. Atlantic Textile P. 1675
7. National Bank Ltd V. Weide & Co. Ltd P. 1691
8. Amobi V. Amobi P. 1715
9. Savannah Bank V. Salami P. 1737
10. Shell Petroleum V. F.B.I.R. P.1756

(SEE P. 1814 FOR OCT. 1996 VOL. 10 PT. 45)

ACTIONS - Subject matter - Whether there are materials before the court - Upon which it found that the subject matter- Had been overtaken by events. Badejo v. Fed. Min. of Educ. p.1609

ACTIONS - Striking out - Where the facts reveal that the subject matter has been overtaken - Whether court could strike out the action - Without further address from counsel. Badejo v. Fed. Min. of Educ. p. 1609

APPEALS - Finding of fact - Where not appealed against - Stands admitted and undisputed. Olukoga v. Fatunde p. 1539

APPEALS - Right of appeal - Plaintiff has no right of appeal to the judgment of trial court - That granted unconditional leave to defend - Pursuant to s: 220 (2) (a) of the Constitution. National Bank Ltd. v. Weide & Co. Ltd p. 1691

APPEALS - Concurrent findings lower courts - When held to be perverse. Shell Petroleum v. F.B.I.R. p. 1756

APPEALS - Findings of fact - By trial court - Where supported by abundant evidence - It should not be reversed. Insurance Brokers v. Atlantic Textile p. 1675

APPEALS - Right of appeal - Is excluded under any of the three cases set out- In s. 220 (2) (a) (b) and (c) of the 1979 constitution. National Bank Ltd. v. Weide & Co. Ltd p. 1691

BANKING - Dishonouring a cheque - Liability of a bank for so doing - When and how does it arise. Savannah Bank v. Salami p. 1737

BANKING - Guarantee - Condition that the account of the guarantor shall be blocked - To maintain a minimum of the amount guaranteed - Implication. Savannah Bank v. Salami p. 1737

CHIEFTAINCY MATTERS - Eligibility for nomination - Whether the grandson of a previous holder of the title - Is eligible for nomination. Oladokun v. Gov. of Oyo State p. 1572

CHIEFTAINCY MATTERS Qualifications stipulated under the Declaration Whether disjunctive or conjunctive interpretation - Should be adopted. Oladokun v. Gov. of Oyo State p. 1572

CHIEFTAINCY MATTERS - Validity of appointment of the chief Where the procedures adopted are invalid - The appointment of the 14th defendant is null and void. *Oladokun v. Gov. of Oyo State* p. 1572

CHIEFTAINCY MATTERS - Lacuna in a Chieftaincy Declaration - As to number of candidates to be nominated - Can be filled by evidence. *Oladokun v. Gov. of Oyo State* p. 1572

CHIEFTAINCY MATTERS - Kingmakers meeting - Where some of those entitled to attend were not invited - The meeting was invalid. *Oladokun v. Gov. of Oyo State* p. 1572

CHIEFTAINCY MATTERS - Family meeting - To nominate a chieftaincy candidate - Where not summoned by the appropriate authority - Whether valid. *Oladokun v. Gov. of Oyo State* p. 1572

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Fundamental right - Motion ex parte - Not to be employed in placing fundamental right - Above the country, state or people. *Badejo v. Fed. Min. of Educ.* p. 1609

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Fundamental right - Move to enforce it –Should not degenerate to using the court - As an instrument of subversion. *Badejo v. Fed Min. of Educ.* p. 1609

CONTRACTS- Accord and Satisfaction Principle - Applies by virtue of the agreement-Between Appellant and the Federal Government. *Shell Petroleum v. F.B.I.R.* p.1756

CONTRACTS-Accord and Satisfaction Principle - Applies to compensate Appellant for the exchange losses - Not the provisions of the Petroleum Profits Tax Act. *Shell Petroleum v. F.B.I.R.* p. 1756

CONTRACTS-Extrinsic evidence - Instance when it can be adduced - To explain a written document. *Savannah Bank v. Salami* p. 1737

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE- Corroboration - Confessional statement – Whether corroborated by other before the court. *Edhigere v. The State* p. 1661 State p.

1661

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Confessional statement - Where not attested by a senior police officer - Whether unreliable. Edhigere v. The State p. 1661

B CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Alibi - Presentation of all materials needed to investigate the alibi - Failure to disprove the alibi - Whether fatal. Chukwu v. The State p. 1555

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Alibi - Where the plea is properly set up -It is not to be treated lightly - As the onus is on the prosecution to disprove it. Chukwu v. The State p. 1555

EVIDENCE - Receipts - Onus of proof - shifts to the defendant who claims to have paid - To tender relevant receipts in proof thereof. Insurance Brokers v. D Atlantic Textile p. 1675

EVIDENCE - Admissions - Whether in the face of admissions made by the defendant - The Court of Appeal was right in dismissing appellant's claim. Insurance Brokers v. Atlantic Textile p. 1675

E

EVIDENCE - Documentary evidence - Tendering documents without being sworn ss. 192 & 193 E.A. - Whether the documents in issue can be tendered without oath. Amobi v. Amohi p. 1715

F EVIDENCE - Proof - Whether plaintiffs evidence fell short of the essential proof- Required to establish its claim. Insurance Brokers v. Atlantic Textile p. 1675

EVIDENCE - Unchallenged evidence - Where the opposite party - Who had G opportunity to challenge plaintiff's ample evidence - Fails to do so - The court will act on that evidence.
Insurance Brokers v. Atlantic Textile p. 1675

EVIDENCE - Contradictions - In prosecution's case - Whether disregarding H them - Will be perverse.
Chukwu v. The State p. 1555

EVIDENCE - Probability - Raised under s. 46 E.A - As to possibility of acts of

possession being evidence of ownership - Whether applicable in all circumstances. *Olukoga v. Fatunde* p. 1539

EVIDENCE - Admissions - Allegedly contained in some tendered exhibits –Is rendered unimportant - By the finding that *res judicata* is not applicable. *Olukoga v. Fatunde* p. 1539 **B**

EVIDENCE - Conflict - Murder - Whether there is any conflict - Between the two exhibits under consideration. *Edhigere v. The State* p. 1661

JURISDICTION - Court of Appeal - Has no jurisdiction to hear and determine appeal against ruling of trial court - Granting unconditional leave to defend suit. *National Bank Ltd. v. Weide & Co. Ltd* p. 1691 **C**

JURISDICTION - Issue not presented - Whether the appellate Federal High Court lacked jurisdiction - Merely because it added “exclusively” - In determining the issue before it. *Shell Petroleum v. F.B.I.R.* p. 1756 **D**

LAND LAW - Title - Where put in issue by virtue of plaintiff’s claim- Plaintiff must prove a better title -In order to succeed. *Amobi v. Amobi* p. 1715 **E**

LAND LAW- Title - Root of title not pleaded and proved - The claim must fail *Amobi v. Amobi* p. 1715

LAND LAW-Dismissal - Where evidence of traditional history and acts of ownership-Fail to establish that plaintiff has a better title than the defendant- Plaintiff’s claim has to be dismissed. *Olukoga v. Fatunde* p. 1539 **F**

MURDER-Alibi- Where not investigated - And the prosecution’s case is full of contradictions - The conviction would be set aside. *Chukwu v. The State* p. 1555 **G**

MURDER – Evidence-Whether sufficient - To justify lower courts’ finding of murder *Edhigere v. The State* p. 1661

PLEADINGS-Evidence- Whether the tendered documents - Relate to the arbitration pleaded. *Amobi v. Amobi* P. 1715 **H**

PLEADINGS-Denial of plaintiff’s averments per se - Vide the statement of

viii INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (1996) 9 KLR

defence Without proving the denial by evidence - Cannot defeat plaintiffs establihed claim. Insurance Brokers v. Atlantic Textile p. 1675

PLEADINGS - Failure to plead a fact in evidence - That evidence goes to no issue. Amobi v. Amohi p. 1715

B

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE – Re-examination - Trial judge’s failure to allow an improper question - Is not a refusal to allow re-examination. Amobi v. Amobi p. 1715

C PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Suo motu issue - Raised by the Supreme Court - Whether proper. National Bank Ltd. v. Weide & Co. Ltd p. 1691

RES JUDICATA - Subject matter - Land law - Whether the parcel of land in issue - Is the same as in the previous suit - Merely because they bear the same

D name. Olukoga v. Fatunde p. 1539

RES JUDICATA - Issue estoppel - Party relying thereon - Has the burden to produce admissible copy of the judgment - And copy of any appeal therein. Olukoga v. Fatunde p. 1539

E

STATUTES - Interpretation of statute - S. 220(2)(c) of the 1979 Constitution - The words used therein being unambiguous - Ought to be construed according to their plain meaning. National Bank Ltd. v. Weide & Co. Ltd p. 1691

F TAX LAW - Bank charges -Where solely and inevitably incurred for petroleum operations - Whether they qualify for deduction - Under the Petroleum Profits Tax Law. Shell Petroleum v. F.B.I.R. p. 1756

TAX LAW - Losses incurred - In sourcing Pound Sterling - For payment of
G Petroleum Tax Is incidental to Appellant’s operation - And therefore deductible. Shell Petroleum v. F.B.I.R. p. 1756

TAX LAW- Scholarship Expenses - Whether expenses incurred for scholarship award - Is incidental to Petroleum Operation. Shell Petroleum v. F.B.I.R.

H p. 1756

TAX LAW- Exchange Charges - When not deductible - Under the provisions of S.10 Petroleum Profits Tax Act. Shell Petroleum v. F.B.I.R. p. 1756

TAX LAW-Petroleum Profits Tax Obligation to pay Petroleum Profit Tax- Is deemed as a debt to the Government of the Federation. Shell Petroleum v. F.B.I.R.p. 1756

WORDS & PHRASES - “All operations incidental thereto” - Cannot be circumscribed to drilling, mining, etc - As the ejusdem generis rule is not applicable. Shell Petroleum v. F.B.I.R. p. 1756

WORDS & PHRASES - Chieftaincy matters - Sons of a previous holder of the title” - Whether to include grand son. Oladokun v. Gov. of Oyo Slalt p. 1572 C

D

E

F

G

H

INDEX OF STATUTES & RULES

Chief Law of Western Region of Nigeria 1957 ss. 15(1)(c), 4(2) Oladokun v. Gov. of Oyo State p. 1572

Chiefs (Appointment & Deposition) Law Cap. 20 Laws of Northern Nigeria s. 11 Oladokun v. Gov. of Oyo State p. 1572

C Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria 1979 ss. 42(1), 6(6), 103(1), 39(1) Badejo v. Fed. Min. of Educ. p. 1609; s. 39(2) Oladokun v. Gov. of Oyo State p. 1572; ss. 31, 69: & 76 Shell Petroleum v. F.B.I.R. p. 1756

Court of Appeal Rules 0.1 r. 20(4) & (5), .3 r. 23 Badejo v. Fed. Min. of Educ. p. 1609

Court of Appeal Act s. 16 Badejo v. Fed. Min. of Educ. p. 1609

Criminal Code s. 319(1) Edhigere v. The State p. 1661

E

Evidence Act ss. 91(1), 100, 180, 192, 193 Amobi v. Amobi p. 1715; s. 132 Savannah Bank v. Salami p. 1737; s. 46 Olukoga v. Fatunde p. 1539

F Fundamental Rights (Enforcement Procedure) rules 1979 0.1 rr. 2(3) & 6 Badejo v. Fed. Min. of Educ. p. 1609

Interpretation Law of Oyo State s. 53 Oladokun v. Gov. of Oyo State p. 1572

Petroleum Profit Tax (Amendment) Act, 1973. Shell Petroleum v. F.B.I.R. . 1756

G

Petroleum Profit Two Act 1959, 2, 8, 9, 10, 11, 15, 16, 29, 31 & 41. Shell Petroleum v. B.I.R. p. 1756

H Supreme Court Rules 0.8 r. 12(5) Amobi v. Amohi p. 1715; O. 6. r. 8(/) Insurance Brokers v. Atlantic Textile p. 1675; 0.6 r. 5(1)(a) Shell Petroleum v. F.B.I.R P. 1756

Supreme Court Act s. 22 Badejo v. Fed. Min. of Educ. p. 1609